

# PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED REGARDING FORMULATION OF ALTERNATIVES

TOPIC	COMMENT	DISPOSITION
<b>PURPOSE AND NEED FOR ACTION</b>		
Purpose & Need	Several of the proposed actions place increasing recreational opportunities above resource protection, and would result in greater damage to natural and cultural resources.	To be addressed in the environmental assessment (EA)
<b>ALTERNATIVES</b>		
Alternatives	Make protection and enhancement of sensitive habitat areas the primary objective of the recreation management plan.	Considered in Conservation Alternative (CA)
Alternatives	Protect against over-development; leave [the Study Area] as untouched as possible.	Considered in CA
Alternatives	Include an alternative that continues the conservation area status and also provides additional resources for management, enforcement, and public education, as well as for restoration of areas that have been negatively affected by illegal activities/lack of management in the past (rather than resources being spent on developing recreational amenities).	Considered in CA
Alternatives	Include an alternative that provides further protection for lands that no longer resemble conservation areas that restores areas negatively affected by past illegal activities within the conservation area and then properly manages them.	Considered in Proposed Alternative (PA) & CA
<b>ACCESS</b>		
Access	If the entire Study Area is not to be managed as a conservation area, reduce road densities throughout the entire Study Area.	Considered in PA
Access	Maintain established dirt roads with periodic grading.	Considered in PA
Access	Prevent use of the mini-staging/parking/ shooting/camping area on the west side of Castle Hot Springs Road going north as it leaves Lake Pleasant Regional Park (LPRP); several residences are located just out of view from this site.	Considered in CA
Access	Manage entry to washes and other riparian areas, similar to what is proposed for springs; identify how entry will be prevented, and how ecosystem damage in all riparian areas will be managed and mitigated.	Considered in PA & CA
Access	Provide safe access for anglers at the culverted Castle Creek crossing; ideally provide a graded parking area to accommodate ~20 vehicles at the southwest end of this crossing. When water is present, provide restroom and trash facilities.	Considered in PA
Access	Allow sportsmen option to access primitive areas using gates with combination locks.	Considered but eliminated: Public lands, if open, must be available to all; lock combination becomes common knowledge; some users may not keep gate locked.
Access-lake	Provide better access to shoreline	Considered in PA
Access-lake	Allow Off-Highway Vehicle (OHV) users on Bureau of Land Management (BLM) land to access lake shore.	Considered in PA
Access-lake	Provide access to the lake (for OHV users).	Considered in PA
Access-lake	Provide easy kayak access at Humbug (and Agua Fria).	Considered in PA (Agua Fria is outside the Study Area)
Access-lake	Provide accessibility to the shoreline (sometimes it is harder to get kayaks to the shore than at other times).	Considered in PA
Access-motorized	Allow less motorized traffic off the water.	Considered in PA & CA
Access-motorized	Limit motorized access to the lake to existing designated access areas outside the Study Area.	Considered in CA
Access-motorized	Regulate/prohibit parking along Castle Hot Springs Road within the roadway, especially at on the north where roadway curves to the west.	Considered in PA & CA
Access-motorized	Provide legal access connecting Table Mesa Road and the Airstrip.	Considered in all alternatives
Access-motorized	Provide a long-distance motorcycle loop that connects Table Mesa Road, the Airstrip, and Crown King.	Considered in PA
<b>AMENITIES</b>		
Amenities	Provide more facilities on the shoreline (toilets/trash receptacles).	Considered in PA
Amenities	Provide fishing dock w/ Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) accessibility.	Considered in PA
Amenities	Provide a fish cleaning station table (but not electric).	Determined not feasible: Maintenance would require intensive resources; possession of filleted fish raises license and legal issues
Amenities	Provide and maintain floating docks for fishing; at least one of these should be installed near the 4-lane ramp parking area.	Considered in PA
Amenities	Provide and maintain floating fishing docks at each end of the Castle Creek crossing; include handicapped access to at least one of these.	Considered in PA
Amenities	Provide primitive and semi-developed sites on the north side of the lake, with improvements to make it more accessible to all.	Considered in PA
<b>TRAILS</b>		
Trails	Provide hiking trails.	Considered in all alternatives
Trails	Include managed and marked trails.	Considered in all alternatives
Trails	Provide more connected trails.	Considered in PA

## PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED REGARDING FORMULATION OF ALTERNATIVES

TOPIC	COMMENT	DISPOSITION
Trails	Provide more walking trails.	Considered in all alternatives
Trails	Provide new single track route north of LPRP to allow access from Table Mesa area to Lake Pleasant area and points west and north; route would cross BLM land and a single section (1 mile) of private land (north of the Agua Fria Conservation Area).	Considered but eliminated: Trail is partially on private land; trail crosses 14,000 acres of essentially undisturbed land; other existing routes provide access.
<b>IMPACTS</b>		
Impacts	Protect against impacts to desert tortoise (whose listing is imminent) by greatly reducing or, preferably, eliminating roads through all suitable habitat and managing other recreational uses to minimize effects to tortoises.	Considered in PA & CA
Impacts	How will access to selected cultural resources be controlled? How will vandalism and destruction of cultural sites be avoided? Will the increased enforcement proposed be sufficient to protect these resources?	To be addressed in Management Plan and analyzed in EA
Impacts	How will the plan balance motorized use with ecological protection and other forms of recreation; how will the plan "establish and maintain a route system consistent with standards for ecological protection, recreation, and permitted uses" be accomplished?	To be addressed in Management Plan and analyzed in EA
Impacts	How will the agencies reduce and mitigate the spread of non-native and invasive species?	To be addressed in Management Plan and analyzed in EA
Impacts	OHVs can have severe negative impacts which are not easily managed or prevented; more and more user-created routes have been appearing in the Study Area and it is likely legalizing motorized routes will not deter this.	To be addressed in Management Plan and analyzed in EA
Impacts	Motorized recreation precludes some other forms of recreation in the nearby area; how do the agencies plan to achieve ecological protection, and balance such uses, as well as manage for and mitigate environmental damage?	To be addressed in Management Plan and analyzed in EA
Impacts	Implement particulate matter/dust emissions control measures for site prep and construction activities (list provided).	To be addressed in Management Plan and analyzed in EA
Impacts	Implement site restoration measures (list provided) to reduce particulate matter/dust emissions.	To be addressed in Management Plan and analyzed in EA
<b>OTHER</b>		
Other	Indicate agencies' sources of funding and other resources for enforcement and successful management.	To be addressed in Management Plan, as appropriate
Other	Include increased staff and enforcement presence as an action under the objective "Designate and implement a system of roads and trails consistent with the BH RMP" to reduce illegal activities and environmental damage.	To be addressed in Management Plan
Other	"Encourage" adherence to speed limits on dirt roads by using other civil traffic citations with higher fines	Sheriffs' offices have jurisdiction over traffic citations
Other	Guard/monitor pay stations during park operating hours.	To be addressed in Management Plan
Other	Include a strong enforcement piece to protect these areas.	To be addressed in Management Plan and described in EA as appropriate
Other	Continue to alternate parking angles in semi-developed spaces; it adds more privacy and makes it seem less like a trailer park	Would be addressed in designs and specifications.
Other	How will routes designated for specific purposes be determined, including location and appropriate use? How will the designation be made clear to visitors? How will illegal routes, that are not part of this designation system, be indicated and their use prohibited?	To be addressed in Management Plan and described in EA as appropriate
Other	What is meant by a "suitable area" (as in establishing suitable areas for various activities)? Some activities, such as watching wildlife, should not be restricted; does establishing suitable areas for watching wildlife imply other areas will not be considered as managed to be suitable or is it merely a way to direct people to areas that have been identified as good wildlife viewing areas?	To be addressed in Management Plan and described in EA as appropriate
Other	"Primitive" and "semi-primitive" camping opportunities need to be clearly defined, and the amount and type of development required to establish these areas needs to be discussed in the EA.	To be addressed in Management Plan and described in EA as appropriate
Other	What is meant by "incompatible recreational use on the Joint planning area?"	To be addressed in Management Plan and described in EA as appropriate
Other	What is meant by long-distance, grazing, and mining routes?	To be addressed in EA
Other	What is meant by providing a loop trail system for "non-licensed" OHV users?	To be addressed in EA
<b>OUTSIDE SCOPE OF RECREATION MANAGEMENT PLAN</b>		
Outside scope	Provide areas for slalom water skiing (smooth water without other users).	Proposed Management Plan addresses land-based objectives; comments on water-based activities addressed on
Outside scope	Make all current "no wake" coves open for skiing on weekdays.	
Outside scope	Provide swim beaches and dive cove (non-motorized only for scuba).	
Outside scope	Designate scuba diving park (in cove).	

## PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED REGARDING FORMULATION OF ALTERNATIVES

TOPIC	COMMENT	DISPOSITION
Outside scope	Provide boat-in camping area.	on-going basis.
<b>OUTSIDE STUDY AREA</b>		
Outside study area	Provide access to the Agua Fria/Table Mesa for kayak launching.	Comments refer to locations outside the Study Area, within the Agua Fria Conservation Area, for which a Management Plan was recently developed; a copy of this Plan is available at: <a href="http://www.usbr.gov/lc/phoenix/reports/afca/AFCAMgtPlan011509.pdf">http://www.usbr.gov/lc/phoenix/reports/afca/AFCAMgtPlan011509.pdf</a>
Outside study area	Conduct a study to determine if motorized boats are affecting bird/wildlife/fish use of the Agua Fria and causing deterioration of the riparian zone; If study shows negative impact, restrict use of Agua Fria accordingly.	
Outside study area	If there are no funds or political will to restrict use of Agua Fria, institute fee/education program and limit extent of use and number of people using area at one time.	
Outside study area	Create an area specifically for non-motorized boats (in the Agua Fria River area)	